

**A. INTRODUCTION**

This chapter summarizes the public participation and agency coordination that has been performed to date as part of the East Side Access Project, and then describes the specific public outreach efforts undertaken for the 50th Street facility.

**B. EAST SIDE ACCESS PROJECT PUBLIC AND AGENCY PARTICIPATION PROGRAM****PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

The public participation effort for the East Side Access Project is being performed in compliance with the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA). Public outreach efforts are also consistent with the requirements of Executive Order 12898 (“Federal Actions to Address Environmental Justice in Minority Populations and Low-Income Populations”) and Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA), as implemented by federal regulations appearing at 36 CFR Part 800.

The primary goal of the public outreach program is to create a public forum for the exchange and discussion of information among the project team, concerned individuals and federal, state, and local agencies. The program has encouraged dialogue among all interested parties, beginning early in the planning process, continuing throughout the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) process, and extending beyond the publication of the Final EIS (FEIS) and issuance of the Record of Decision (ROD), to address issues as they arise during the later phases of design and construction.

The East Side Access Project has conducted an extensive public participation program, beginning in 1995 during preparation of the Major Investment Study, and continuing through preparation of the Draft EIS (DEIS) and FEIS in 2001. This program included presentations and meetings for interested parties, presentations and question and answer sessions at community board meetings in New York City, general information meetings for the public, presentations and meetings with transit organizations, technical and citizens advisory committee meetings, meetings with relevant regulatory and environmental agencies, public hearings, and printed materials (fact sheets, brochures, etc.). Further details of the public participation program undertaken throughout the EIS process are provided in the FEIS (see Chapter 23, “Process and Public Participation”).

Since the publication of the FEIS and issuance of the ROD, public outreach activities for the East Side Access Project have included dozens of individual meetings with affected stakeholders. Representatives of the East Side Access Project also regularly participate in meetings of Community Boards representing areas affected by the project, as well as meetings of community organizations such as the East Side Neighborhood Association.

## **AGENCY PARTICIPATION**

Environmental and other regulatory agencies met in January 1999 to review the scope of the studies to be prepared for the EIS. Throughout the EIS process, additional meetings were held with the New York City Department of Transportation, the Queens Office of the New York City Department of City Planning, the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC), the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) at the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, and other agencies to discuss various aspects of the East Side Access Project. Agency outreach activities are scheduled throughout the design and construction phases of the project to promote discussion of issues and exchange of information about it.

## **C. AGENCY COORDINATION AND PUBLIC OUTREACH FOR PROPOSED 50TH STREET FACILITY**

MTA is coordinating with city, state, and federal agencies regarding the 50th Street facility. These agencies include the New York City Department of Transportation, New York City Fire Department (FDNY), New York City Department of City Planning, SHPO, New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission, and other relevant agencies. Agency coordination specifically related to security issues is conducted through MTA's participation in the New York City Joint Terrorism Infrastructure Task Force. This is described in greater detail in Chapter 14, "Safety and Security."

Public outreach for the 50th Street facility has included individual stakeholder meetings, as well as public meetings held on February 24, 2004, and February 10, 2005. These meetings are described below.

The fuel oil storage tank—to be located in the lowest level of the new facility in Alternatives B and C, and off-site within the East Side Access concourse in Preferred Alternative D—is subject to NYSDEC's petroleum bulk storage regulations. In addition, the tank would be installed in accordance with the requirements of the FDNY, which has reviewed and approved the location and design of the fuel oil storage tank under each of the alternatives.

### **INDIVIDUAL STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS**

As part of the design process for the 50th Street facility, and the preparation of the 2005 Environmental Assessment (EA) and this revised supplemental EA, several individual meetings have been held with representatives of properties that would be affected and with other area stakeholders. These meetings, which are listed in Table 19-1, have been held to provide information about the facility to the stakeholders, as well as to listen to their concerns and suggestions about how the proposed facility could be modified.

### **PUBLIC MEETING HELD ON FEBRUARY 24, 2004**

A draft outline for the EA was distributed in February 2004 and a public meeting was held on February 24, 2004, at 347 Madison Avenue to provide information on the 50th Street facility and to solicit comments on the analyses to be included in the EA. Comments were accepted through March 9, 2004. Comments made at that meeting were addressed in relevant portions of the January 2005 EA.

**Table 19-1**  
**50th Street Facility Stakeholder Meetings**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Stakeholder or Representative</b>	<b>Discussion Topic</b>
1/15/2003	Herbert Rubin, Herzfeld & Rubin	Proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 46 East 50th Street
1/22/2003	Dan Shkrel, Sezar Real Estate Corp.	Proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 50 East 50th Street
1/30/2003	Sanjeev and Katrina Nath	Proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 48 East 50th Street
3/12/2003	Lewis Schweller, Schweller & Sutherland	Proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 44 East 50th Street
3/14/2004	Capalino + Company	Proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 48 East 50th Street
3/18/2003	Archdiocese of New York, Real Estate Division	Proposed 50th Street facility
4/4/2003	Robert Kaufman	Proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 437 Madison Avenue
4/11/2003	Tishman Speyer Properties—300 Park Avenue building owner	Proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 300 Park Avenue
3/10/2004	437 Madison Avenue building manager	Proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 437 Madison Avenue
5/20/2004	437 Madison Avenue building owner	Design review of proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 437 Madison Avenue
9/7/2004	437 Madison Avenue building owner	Design review of proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 437 Madison Avenue
10/15/2004	45 East 49th Street building owner	Design review of proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 45 East 49th Street
12/21/2004	ING Bank—45 East 49th Street tenant	Design review of proposed 50th Street facility; effects on 45 East 49th Street
1/26/2005	ING Bank—45 East 49th Street tenant	Real estate acquisition process
1/26/2005	Palace Hotel	Review results of January 2005 EA
1/27/2005	Manhattan Community Board 5 District Manager and Chairperson	Review results of January 2005 EA
1/28/2005	Manhattan Borough President	Review results of January 2005 EA
1/31/2005	Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney	Review results of January 2005 EA
1/31/2005	320 Park Avenue	Review results of January 2005 EA
2/1/2005	Regional Plan Association—Jeff Zupan	Review project design and results of January 2005 EA
2/2/2005	Waldorf Astoria	Review results of January 2005 EA
2/2/2005	Manhattan Community Board 5 Transportation Committee	Review results of January 2005 EA
3/1/2005	Municipal Art Society	Review results of January 2005 EA
3/1/2005	Historic Districts Council	Review results of January 2005 EA
3/1/2005	New York Landmarks Conservancy	Review results of January 2005 EA
3/14/2005	Manhattan Community Board 6 Safety Committee	Review results of January 2005 EA
4/18/2005	Tishman Speyer Properties—300 Park Avenue building owner	Review results of January 2005 EA

**Table 19-1 (cont'd)  
50th Street Facility Stakeholder Meetings**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Stakeholder or Representative</b>	<b>Discussion Topic</b>
6/28/2005 7/19/2005 8/16/2005 8/19/2005	Tishman Speyer Properties—300 Park Avenue building owner	Review new preferred alternative (Preferred Alternative D) and engineering considerations of new cooling tower locations.
11/16/2005	Municipal Art Society	Review Preferred Alternative D
11/16/2005	Historic Districts Council	Review Preferred Alternative D
11/22/2005	Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney	Review Preferred Alternative D
11/22/2005	Palace Hotel	Review Preferred Alternative D
11/30/2005	Archdiocese of New York	Review Preferred Alternative D
11/30/2005	Manhattan Community Board 5 Transportation Committee	Review Preferred Alternative D
12/6/2005	Assemblyman Jonathan Bing	Review Preferred Alternative D
12/8/2005	437 Madison Avenue building owner	Review treatment of party wall between 50th Street facility and 437 Madison Avenue
12/20/2005	437 Madison Avenue building owner	Review treatment of party wall between 50th Street facility and 437 Madison Avenue
1/5/2006	320 Park Avenue building owner	Review Preferred Alternative D
3/2/06	437 Madison Avenue building owner	Review treatment of party wall between 50th Street facility and 437 Madison Avenue
4/5/06	437 Madison Avenue building owner	Review treatment of party wall between 50th Street facility and 437 Madison Avenue

**PUBLIC REVIEW OF JANUARY 2005 EA**

The January 2005 EA was circulated to involved and interested agencies and other parties and posted on MTA’s website the week of January 12, 2005. Notice of its availability was also posted on MTA’s website at the same time. The document was also available for review at the East Side Access Project office, MTA headquarters, and the offices of FTA, and the document was distributed to approximately 180 people on the project’s mailing list. During the public review period, MTA held a public hearing to receive comments on the document on February 10, 2005. To advertise the public hearing and to provide notice of the availability of the EA, MTA published notices in newspapers of general circulation in the project area the weeks of January 10 and January 17. In addition, information on the public hearing was posted on the MTA’s website, and a notice of public hearing was mailed on January 11 to public officials and interested parties in the project area. In response to requests from the public, the public comment period, originally scheduled to be open through February 22, 2005, was held open through March 8, 2005.

Comments on January 2005 EA, which were received from over 50 government agencies, elected officials, organizations, and individuals, are summarized in Chapter 20, “Comments and Responses,” of this revised supplemental EA.

In response to comments received on the January 2005 EA, a new design for the 50th Street facility has been developed, which substantially modifies the preferred alternative identified in that document. The new preferred alternative, Preferred Alternative D, relocates a number of the facility's functions either below grade, to the concourse, or to an adjacent building. The 50th Street facility would be substantially smaller—about half the width and less than half the height. A landscaped public open space would be provided on the remainder of the site (40 feet wide by 60 feet deep). More information on Preferred Alternative D and its potential environmental impacts and benefits is provided in Chapter 2 of this revised supplemental EA.

### **PUBLIC OUTREACH FOR THIS REVISED SUPPLEMENTAL EA**

This revised supplemental EA has been published in the same manner as the January 2005 EA. A full printed copy of the first volume of the EA, together with a CD of the appendix volume of the EA, has been circulated to involved and interested agencies and other parties and posted on MTA's website. In addition, the document is available for review at the East Side Access Project office, MTA headquarters, and the offices of FTA (specific addresses for these locations are provided below), and the document was distributed to approximately 180 people on the project's mailing list (see below). Printed copies of the appendix volume are available upon request.

Following the publication of this revised supplemental EA, there will be a 30-day public comment period. During this period, a public hearing will be held to solicit comments on the revised supplemental EA. Following the comment period, MTA will evaluate all comments received and will respond accordingly. FTA will take all public comments into consideration when making the determination of significance regarding the environmental impacts associated with the 50th Street facility.

### *DOCUMENT AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW*

The revised supplemental EA is available for review on the internet at MTA's website, [www.mta.info](http://www.mta.info) (click "Capital Construction" and "East Side Access"). It is also available for review at the following locations:

- East Side Access, Project 469 Seventh Avenue, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10018
- MTA Headquarters, 347 Madison Avenue, 9th Floor Law Library, New York, NY 10017
- Federal Transit Administration, One Bowling Green, Room 429, New York, NY 10004

### *DOCUMENT DISTRIBUTION*

In addition, the revised supplemental EA has been mailed to more than 180 people, including those at the organizations listed below.

#### *Federal Agencies*

- United States Department of Homeland Security
- United States Department of Interior
- United States Department of Transportation, Federal Highway Administration
- United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2

## **50th Street Facility Revised Supplemental Environmental Assessment**

---

### *New York State Agencies*

- New York State Department of Environmental Conservation
- New York State Department of Transportation
- New York State Office of Parks, Recreation & Historic Preservation

### *City/Local Agencies*

- Fire Department of New York City
- Manhattan Community Board 5
- Manhattan Community Board 6
- Mayor's Office of Environmental Coordination
- New York City Department of City Planning, Manhattan Office
- New York City Department of Environmental Protection
- New York City Department of Transportation
- New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
- New York City Police Department

### *Elected Officials*

- United States Senator Charles E. Schumer
- United States Senator Hillary Rodham Clinton
- United States Representative Carolyn B. Maloney (District 14)
- Governor George E. Pataki
- New York State Senator Liz Krueger (District 26)
- New York State Assemblymember Jonathan Bing (District 73)
- New York State Assemblymember Richard Gottfried (District 75)
- New York State Assemblymember Alexander Grannis (District 65)
- New York State Assemblymember Sylvia Friedman (District 74)
- Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg
- Manhattan Borough President Scott M. Stringer
- New York City Councilmember Christine Quinn (Speaker)
- New York City Councilmember Daniel R. Garodnick (District 4)
- Public Advocate for the City of New York Betsy Gotbaum

### *Interested Parties at Affected Properties*

- 45 East 49th Street (Block 1285, Lot 29)
- 44 East 50th Street (Block 1285, Lot 46)
- 35 East 50th Street (Block 1286, Lot 30)
- 46 East 50th Street (Block 1285, Lot 45)
- 48 East 50th Street (Block 1285, Lot 44)
- 50 East 50th Street (Block 1285, Lot 43)

- 301 Park Ave (Block 1304, Lot 9001)
- 321 Park Ave (Block 1305, Lot 1)

*Others*

- Archdiocese of New York
- Citizens for a Safe East Fiftieth Street
- Civitas
- East 79th Street Neighborhood Association
- Grand Central Partnership
- ING Direct
- Municipal Art Society
- Palace Hotel
- Saint Bartholomew's Church
- Sutton Area Community, Inc.
- Tishman Speyer Properties
- Turtle Bay Association
- Waldorf Astoria Hotel
- William Kaufman Organization, Ltd.

**D. FTA AND MTA CONTACTS**

For further information regarding this revised EA, please contact:

Mr. Irwin B. Kessman  
Director of Planning and Program Development  
Federal Transit Administration, Region II  
One Bowling Green  
New York, NY 10004  
(212) 668-2170

Mr. Joseph Petrocelli  
Chief Administrative Officer  
MTA/LIRR East Side Access  
469 Seventh Avenue  
New York, NY 10018  
(212) 967-0218

\*