

4.1 INTRODUCTION

This Supplemental Environmental Assessment (EA) to the FEIS considers the environmental effects of the proposed changes to the location of two entrances at two of the Second Avenue Subway project's 16 stations. For eight environmental areas evaluated in the FEIS, the No Action Alternative and the Build entrance alternatives for the 72nd and 86th Street Stations would have no potential to change the conclusions of the FEIS. These eight areas are as follows:

1. Public open space;
2. Infrastructure and energy;
3. Contaminated materials;
4. Natural resources;
5. Coastal zone consistency;
6. Safety;
7. Environmental justice; and
8. Indirect and cumulative impacts.

Those issues are discussed briefly in this chapter. The impacts of the No Action Alternative are consistent with the conclusions presented in the FEIS with regard to these eight issue areas. For each area, the conclusions of the FEIS are presented, followed by a discussion of the reasons why the No Action Alternative and the Build entrance alternatives would not differ from those conclusions.

4.2 ENVIRONMENTAL SCREENING ANALYSIS

4.2.1 PUBLIC OPEN SPACE

4.2.1.1 FEIS FINDINGS

The FEIS identified significant adverse impacts that would occur during construction on open spaces along the 8.5-mile alignment of the Second Avenue Subway. In addition, five parks along the 8.5-mile alignment were identified as having the potential for permanent impacts as a result of the Second Avenue Subway. However, no impacts were identified near the planned location for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station and no public open spaces are located near the station locations.

4.2.1.2 CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Since no open public open spaces are located near the location of the new 72nd Street or 86th Street Station, no open space resources would be impacted by the construction of the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station.

**Supplemental EA to the Second Avenue Subway FEIS:
72nd Street and 86th Street Station Entrance Alternatives**

4.2.1.3 PERMANENT IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Since no open public open spaces are located near the location of the new 72nd Street or 86th Street Station, none would be impacted by operation of the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station.

4.2.2 INFRASTRUCTURE AND ENERGY

4.2.2.1 FEIS FINDINGS

As described in the FEIS in Chapter 13, “Infrastructure and Energy,” construction work for the Second Avenue Subway that involves excavation of city streets could affect the utilities that are buried beneath them (see page 13-5 of the FEIS). Any construction activities that could disturb utilities would require special measures to protect them during construction, which could involve supporting, replacing, or relocating lines where necessary to avoid service disruptions and maintain continuous service to utility customers.

Chapter 13 of the FEIS also describes the Second Avenue Subway’s effects on infrastructure and energy once the project is completed. No significant adverse impacts were identified.

4.2.2.2 CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

The conclusions of the FEIS with respect to effects on infrastructure and energy during construction would not be altered by the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station. Cut-and-cover construction would be required for each alternative, which would entail utility relocation. As described in the FEIS (see page 13-6), utilities would be maintained in place where practicable. The No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station would also not materially change the amount of energy required during construction as compared with the analysis presented in the FEIS.

4.2.2.3 PERMANENT IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Once the new subway is completed and operational, no significant adverse impacts would occur related to infrastructure or energy with the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station.

4.2.3 CONTAMINATED MATERIALS

4.2.3.1 FEIS FINDINGS

An investigation was conducted during design development of the possibility to encounter subsurface contaminated materials in areas to be excavated for the Second Avenue Subway. The FEIS summarizes the conclusions of the initial investigations conducted in Chapter 14, “Contaminated Materials.” As discussed there, the Preliminary Environmental Site Investigations and subsequent subsurface investigations identified potential contaminated materials that are typical of those found in urban areas.

The FEIS also describes the additional investigations to be undertaken during ongoing engineering and into construction. It describes the preventative measures to be undertaken during construction to protect the safety of the public, community residents, and construction workers, as well as subway workers and the larger environment for areas where contaminated materials may currently be present. The use of these measures would not be affected by the proposed design modification. Measures to be followed include developing and implementing site-specific Health and Safety Plans (HASPs) describing in detail the health and safety guidelines, procedures, and work practices that must followed during construction. If fuel oil tanks are present in City-owned vault spaces beneath the sidewalk that would be acquired for use by the project, these tanks would be closed and removed in accordance with all applicable regulations. Similarly, any asbestos-containing materials or lead paint would also be handled in accordance with all applicable regulations.

The FEIS also describes ongoing practices to be followed once the Second Avenue Subway is complete to manage possible contaminated groundwater that might enter subway stations or tunnels, and to handle chemicals used at subway maintenance and storage yards.

4.2.3.2 CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

The protocols described in the FEIS related to contaminated materials would also be followed for construction of the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station in order to prevent potential risks and thereby avoid the potential for significant adverse impacts related to contaminated materials.

4.2.3.3 PERMANENT IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Once the new subway is completed and operational, no significant adverse impacts would occur related to contaminated materials with the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station. The measures described in the FEIS would not be changed as a result of the station entrance alternatives.

4.2.4 NATURAL RESOURCES

4.2.4.1 FEIS FINDINGS

As described in the FEIS (see Chapter 15, “Natural Resources,” page 15-5), construction activities for the Second Avenue Subway would result in the removal of some mature trees in parks and on streets, but this would not create a significant adverse impact on natural resources because the number of trees that would be removed represents a small fraction of New York City’s urban forest and, as discussed below, the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) New York City Transit will be implementing a tree replacement program in coordination with the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation (NYCDPR). Street trees would have to be removed at each station location where cut-and-cover construction would occur. This would be required for the length of each cut-and-cover area and could also be required for a work zone extending past the excavation area. Street trees could also be affected for up to 100 feet on each side street adjacent to the station construction zone and for as much as 500 feet on side streets

**Supplemental EA to the Second Avenue Subway FEIS:
72nd Street and 86th Street Station Entrance Alternatives**

where new entrances are proposed. In certain cases due to utility relocation, impacts on trees may extend beyond the limits stated above.

4.2.4.2 CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Consistent with the discussion in the FEIS, the No Action Alternative and station entrance alternatives at the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations would all require removal of street trees in areas where excavation would occur. In addition, depending on the final Maintenance and Protection of Traffic Plan (MPT Plan) implemented for 72nd Street and 86th Street, additional trees along those streets could be removed to allow use of the sidewalk area as part of the MPT Plan. **Table 4-1** provides a comparison of the number of trees that could potentially be removed during construction for the No Action Alternative and the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations. As shown, Alternative 1 at the 72nd Street Station and Alternative 5 at the 86th Street Station would result in the removal of fewer trees than the No Action Alternative. The other station entrance alternatives—Alternatives 3 and 4 for the 72nd Street Station and Alternatives 2 and 7 for the 86th Street Station—would result in removal of the same number of trees as the No Action Alternative, because their MPT Plans would affect the same area.

Table 4-1
Street Trees Removed for Station Entrance Construction

Alternative	Trees Removed for Station Entrance Construction
72nd Street Station	
No Action Alternative	29
Alternative 1 (Preferred)	3
Alternative 3	29
Alternative 4	29
86th Street Station	
No Action Alternative	19
Alternative 2	19
Alternative 5	3
Alternative 7 (Preferred)	19
Note:	
The number of trees presented in this table is only for construction activities east of Second Avenue, since the trees that would be removed west of Second Avenue and along Second Avenue itself would be common to all alternatives.	

4.2.4.3 PERMANENT IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Once construction is complete, MTA New York City Transit would plant new trees to replace those lost during construction. No new trees would be planted in the area directly above the station entrance (i.e., the area between the two new escalator entrances for Alternative 3 at the 72nd Street Station and Alternatives 2 and 7 at the 86th Street Station). If trees cannot be replanted in their current location, a suitable alternative location would be identified in

consultation with NYCDPR. All trees that would be removed by construction of the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Stations would be replaced, and none of the alternatives would result in significant adverse impacts on natural resources.

4.2.5 COASTAL ZONE CONSISTENCY

4.2.5.1 FEIS FINDINGS

Portions of the Second Avenue Subway alignment in Lower Manhattan are located within the City's designated Coastal Zone. However, the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations and entrances would not be within the Coastal Zone.

4.2.5.2 CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Since the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations and entrances would not be within the Coastal Zone, construction activities for the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station would not affect the Second Avenue Subway project's consistency with the policies of New York State's and New York City's Coastal Zone Management Programs.

4.2.5.3 PERMANENT IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Since the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations and entrances would not be within the Coastal Zone, the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station would not affect the Second Avenue Subway project's consistency with the policies of New York State's and New York City's Coastal Zone Management Programs.

4.2.6 SAFETY

4.2.6.1 FEIS FINDINGS

The FEIS presents design measures and operational practices to be used to protect passengers and workers as well as the community during design and construction of the Second Avenue Subway.

4.2.6.2 CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

The safety measures presented in the FEIS would not be affected by construction of the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station.

4.2.6.3 PERMANENT IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

The safety measures presented in the FEIS would not be affected by operation of the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street or 86th Street Station.

4.2.7 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE

4.2.7.1 FEIS FINDINGS

The FEIS evaluates the Second Avenue Subway project's consistency with Executive Order 12898, "Federal Actions to Address Environmental Justice in Minority Populations and Low-Income Populations." It identifies areas along the 8.5-mile alignment where low-income and minority populations are present, determines whether disproportionate impacts would occur to those populations, and describes public outreach measures undertaken to reach those affected communities. As described in the FEIS in Chapter 18, "Environmental Justice," the population in the area around the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations is not low-income or minority in nature.

4.2.7.2 CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Since the population in the area around the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations is not low-income or minority in nature, the No Action Alternative and the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations do not have the potential to result in disproportionate impacts to low-income or minority populations during construction and, therefore, the conclusions of the FEIS with respect to environmental justice would not change with implementation of the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations.

4.2.7.3 PERMANENT IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES

Since the population in the area around the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations is not low-income or minority in nature, the No Action Alternative and the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations do not have the potential to result in disproportionate impacts to low-income or minority populations once the subway is completed and, therefore, the conclusions of the FEIS, with respect to environmental justice would not change with implementation of the No Action Alternative or the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations.

4.2.8 INDIRECT AND CUMULATIVE EFFECTS

4.2.8.1 FEIS FINDINGS

The FEIS describes the Second Avenue Subway project's potential indirect and cumulative impacts in Chapter 19, "Indirect and Cumulative Effects." That chapter describes indirect effects that might result during construction, such as disruption related to displacement required for construction of the subway. It also describes indirect effects, such as benefits to neighborhood character, that might result from the increased accessibility once the new subway is complete. For cumulative impacts, the chapter considers the potential for cumulative construction impacts if the Second Avenue Subway construction activities occur at the same time as other projects' construction activities nearby.

*4.2.8.2 CONSTRUCTION IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION
ENTRANCE ALTERNATIVES*

As described in this EA, the No Action Alternative and the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations would not alter the conclusions of the FEIS related to significant adverse impacts during construction and would not require new mitigation that was not described in the FEIS or required by the Record of Decision. Therefore, the No Action Alternative and the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations also would not change the conclusions of the FEIS with respect to the Second Avenue Subway project's indirect and cumulative effects during construction.

*4.2.8.3 PERMANENT IMPACTS OF THE 72ND AND 86TH STREET STATION ENTRANCE
ALTERNATIVES*

As described in this EA, the No Action Alternative and the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations would not alter the conclusions of the FEIS related to significant adverse impacts once the subway is completed and would not require new mitigation that was not described in the FEIS or required by the Record of Decision. Therefore, the No Action Alternative and the station entrance alternatives for the 72nd Street and 86th Street Stations also would not change the conclusions of the FEIS with respect to the Second Avenue Subway project's indirect and cumulative effects upon completion of the Second Avenue Subway. *