

The study includes three alternative evaluation/screening steps. All evaluation criteria tie directly to the goals and objectives of the study and take into account the level of information/data available at each stage of the study. **Airport service and commuter service will be evaluated separately within each step.**

SCREEN 1 - Fatal Flaw Screen (Long List to Revised Long List)

Screen 1 includes two steps: Consolidation/Combination and Pass/Fail Fatal Flaw Screen. The first step will include a review of the Long List alternatives to evaluate whether there are similar or repetitive alternatives. These alternatives will be consolidated/combined with others and the specific alternative numbers will be referenced. The second step will assess each alternative against the Screen 1 criteria and assigned a “Pass,” “Fail,” or “Uncertain” rating based on how well the alternative met the goal where generally:

- Fail (F) = Does not meet requirement
- Uncertain (U) = Unclear whether alternative addresses requirement or Not Applicable
- Pass (P) = Addresses requirement

Any alternative that receives a “Fail” rating for one or more of the criteria will be eliminated from further study.

Proposed Screen 1 criteria include:

- Travel time between Jamaica and LM
- Travel time between JFK and LM
- Number of commuter/airport transfers
- Impacts to existing services
- Available capacity for peak commuter and airport services

SCREEN 2 - Long List Screen (Revised Long List to Short List)

The Screen 2 - Long List Screen is more detailed and quantitative than the Screen 1 Fatal Flaw due to the engineering, operational, and cost data developed for the Revised Long List alternatives. The criteria will be assessed for each alternative and a score of 1-5 (1 is worst, 5 is best) will be assigned to each. The specific scoring ranges for each criterion will be determined once the range of detailed data is available.

Proposed Screen 2 criteria include Screen 1 criteria plus:

- Capital costs
- Future connectivity to other regional transportation links
- Service frequency
- Impacts to existing infrastructure
- Environmental impacts
- Institutional impacts

SCREEN 3 - Short List Screen (Short List to Recommended Alternative)

The Short List alternatives will be developed in even more detail, and as a result, will include additional criteria such as ridership and cost-effectiveness. As in Screen 2, the criteria will be assessed for each alternative and a score of 1-5 (1 is worst, 5 is best) will be assigned to each. The specific scoring ranges for each criterion will be determined once the range of detailed data is available.

**Lower Manhattan-Jamaica/JFK Transportation Project
Proposed Screening Criteria**

DRAFT

Proposed Screen 3 criteria include Screen 1 and 2 criteria plus:

- Operating cost
- Revenue
- Total transit trips
- New transit trips
- Economic development
- Farebox recovery
- Capital cost per rider
- Incremental cost per transportation system benefit
- Operating cost per passenger mile
- Travel time
- Improved service reliability/schedule reliability
- Airport induced demand

Screen 3 also includes a trade-off analysis which will focus on the key differences among the alternatives across all of the quantitative and qualitative perspectives. This analysis highlights the advantages and disadvantages of each alternative and identifies the key trade-offs of costs and benefits. The evaluation will be in narrative format and will clearly focus on the differences between alternatives. The alternative that has the best rating in both the quantitative and qualitative evaluations and has the most compelling evidence of overall performance as highlighted through the trade-off analysis will be selected as the recommended alternative(s).