

West of Hudson Regional Transit Access Study

DRAFT **Level 1 Screening**

Open House

June 1, 2009

DRAFT

LEVEL 1 SCREENING

June 2009

The Level 1 Screening process was conducted to identify from the Long List of alternatives a set of fewer but more promising alternatives that have the potential to meet project goals and objectives. Each of the alternatives were assessed based on their ability to best serve and address the separate but related airport and commuter markets, considering short-term, mid-term, and long-range (2035) needs.

The objective of Level 1 Screening was to eliminate alternatives that clearly would not meet the Study's goals, would have major unavoidable adverse impacts or which have extremely high costs relative to anticipated benefits.

The approach taken was to conduct the Level 1 screening in two passes. First, the alternatives were evaluated to determine what benefit if any they offer against the No-Build Alternative considering their likely performance overall across each screening criteria and measure. Second, the process considered the relative performance of the alternatives compared to each other within same transit category or group. For example, where multiple alternatives perform better than No-Build within a particular mode or market the lowest rated among them would be eliminated in favor of the higher or better performing alternatives.

The evaluation of the alternatives during the Level 1 Screening was based on the following three general criteria:

- Transportation,
- Environment, and
- Cost.

One or more screening measures were developed for each of the criteria listed above. At Level 1 the screening performance measures are primarily qualitative. The alternatives were developed only to a general level sufficient to make an assessment using a Yes/No or High/Medium/Low (H/M/L) rating system for the first two criteria and magnitude capital costs for the third criteria. The qualitative measures relied on professional judgment and were applied using general defined parameters.

Table 1 provides preliminary results and recommendation of the Level 1 Screening.

Table 1 – Level 1 Screening Preliminary Results and Recommendations

Grouping	Alternative	Level 1 Screen Preliminary Results and Recommendations			
		Airport Market		Commuter Market	
		Rating	Recommendation	Rating	Recommendation
1 Direct Regional Bus	B-C1	N/A	N/A	High	✓
	B-C2	N/A	N/A	High	✓
	B-XN	High	✓	N/A	N/A
	B-XE	High	✓	N/A	N/A
	B-XW	High	✓	N/A	N/A
	B-XS	High	✓	N/A	N/A
	B-XC	High	✓	N/A	N/A
	B-XM	High	✓	N/A	N/A
	B-XD	High	✓	N/A	N/A
	B-XG	High	✓	N/A	N/A
	B-A	High	✓	N/A	N/A
2 Direct CRT via Port Jervis Line	R-C1.1	Medium	X	Medium	X
	R-C1.2/3	High	✓	High	✓
	R-C1.4	High	✓	High	✓
	R-C1.5	Medium	X	Medium	X
	R-C1.6	High/Medium	✓	High/Medium	✓
	R-C3.1	Medium	X	Medium	X
	R-C3.2/3	Medium	X	Medium	X
	R-C3.4	High/Medium	✓	High/Medium	✓
	R-C3.5	Medium	X	Medium	X
	R-W1	Medium	X	Medium	X
	R-W2	Medium	X	Medium	X
	R-W3	Medium	X	Medium	X
	R-H1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	R-M1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	R-D1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
R-J1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X	
3 Direct CRT via Hudson Line	R-B1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	R-B3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X

Key

✓ = Retain

X = Drop

Table 1 (continued) – Level 1 Screening Preliminary Results and Recommendations

Grouping	Alternative	Level 1 Screen Preliminary Results and Recommendations			
		Airport Market		Commuter Market	
		Rating	Recommendation	Rating	Recommendation
4 Hybrid CRT via Port Jervis Line	RP-C3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RA-C3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RL-C3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RB-C3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RP-D1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RA-D1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RL-D1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RB-D1	Medium/Low	X	High/Medium	X
	RP-H1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RA-H1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RP-M1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RA-M1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RA-C1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RL-C1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RB-C1	High/Medium	✓	High/Medium	✓
RX-C1	High/Medium	✓	High/Medium	✓	
5 Hybrid CRT via Hudson Lin	RA-B1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RL-B1	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RB-B1	High/Medium	✓	High/Medium	✓
	RX-B1	High/Medium	✓	High/Medium	✓
	RP-B3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RA-B3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RA-B3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RL-B3	Medium/Low	X	Medium/Low	X
	RB-B3	Medium/Low	X	High/Medium	✓
6 High Speed Ferry 7 TSM/TDM	WB-N	Low	X	Low	X
	Various	Pass	✓	Pass	✓

Key

✓ = Retain

X = Drop

Note: TSM/TDM alternatives were screened on a pass/fail basis only during Level 1 and will be defined more fully during Level 2.