Paratransit Advisory Committee (PAC)

November 7, 2024

Meeting Minutes

The PAC meeting was conducted virtually via Zoom.

1. Welcome from PAC Leadership

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson RueZalia Watkins at 5:08 p.m.

2. Confirmation of participants and approval of minutes

PAC Members
Thomas Coppola, Luda Demikovskaya, Billy Mitchell, Jean Ryan, Sharada Veerubhotla, RueZalia Watkins, Tucker Salovaara, Ketrina Hazell,

Absent – Jose Hernandez, Mark Anthony Phifer

Chair Watkins acknowledgement that former PAC members Ellen Rubin and Mindy Jacobson have been removed from the roster as members of the Paratransit Advisory Committee.

MTA/NYCT Paratransit
Patricia Ibarguen, Diane McFarlane, Frank Camp, Eugene Griffith, Beverlyn Richards, Shari Bhushun-Ogbourne, Lynda Edmond, Nathasha Parris, Rachel Cohen, Tejpal Prajapati, Simone Harvard, Steve Scott, Kevin Flores, Jayashri Srinivasan-Cuffey, Tanisha Morgan, Weiming Liang, Samson Onilude

Minutes from the September 26, 2024, meeting was approved.

3. AAR Service Updates / Dashboard AAR Report

R. Cohen delivered the report (PowerPoint presentation was shared).

Chair Watkins inquired about data on wait times in the call center between the hours of 3pm and 5pm, and is that data is collected?

R. Cohen noted ParaWeb Reservation Tool has helped agents input reservations more quickly and is becoming increasingly used and is particularly advantageous during those hours.

Luda commented that the highest wait times is between 2pm and 4pm, but interactions from reservations staff has been great.

Chair Watkins asked to add this matter to New Business, along with how long it takes for a trip to be assigned.

F. Camp shared that the reservation portal between 2pm and 5pm call wait times are less than a minute on busy day, especially between 4pm and 5pm. Will try to pull some numbers during this call.

P. Ibarguen noted that (for example) yesterday the call center answered 99% of calls within 20 seconds.

4. **Paratransit Topics:**

Subscription Service

Addressed concerns that customer have expressed that subscription service trips may not perform as well as non-subscription. After a deep dive investigation there is no pattern particular pattern in comparing subscription trips vs. non-subscription trips. Hopefully, this information could be shared with subscription customers and

K. Hazell asked if a data point could be added to the public metrics for late drop-offs.

R. Cohen noted this data point is already part of the metrics posted on mta.info dashboard for drop offs of appointment time-based trips. We do not distinguish in the public data a distinction between subscription vs. non-subscription trips. But we did look at that data point internally, and there was no meaning full pattern observed in terms of appointment time drop offs between subscription v. non-subscription.

J. Ryan asked about OTP of subscription trips on the weekend. R. Cohen noted it should be about 10%. *Metrics were shared in the chat*.

Chair Watkins noted K. Hazell's inquiry is not only about the time customers get home, but it's also a question of how many rescues are added to the routes of customers who are medically fragile / vulnerable.

S. Veerubhotla asked when are all rides scheduled for the next day (after 5pm)?

S. Harvard explained once the reservations department closes daily at 5pm the entire schedule is put together at once. T. Prajapati noted the deadline to book trips on the app is also 5pm, same as reservations call center. S. Veerubhotla suggested the time to book trips on the app be extended past 5pm (even by 30 minutes).

J. Ryan noted the window to make reservations sometimes closes prior to 5pm (10 minutes before 5, not just by a few minutes), and *she would like to see this investigated*. Chair Watkins concurred that many of her trips are 'add-ons' to subscription routes, which is why she inquired about the subject.

Chair Watkins will move this matter on the agenda under New Business.

R. Cohen followed-up on J. Ryan's inquiry from the previous meeting regarding booking trips on the app with one time and then the time changing. Chair Watkins responded it's this issue and when being waitlisted and you don't know what until late in the evening when the time is finalized.

J. Ryan noted vehicle arrives too early and then customers miss their ride. Also, when she books trips what occurs overnight then the vehicle changes at the last minute, and she cannot ride in certain vehicles (dedicated).

T. Prajapati clarified that the issues with changes are not an app issue, it's being changed for appointment trips. The system has been tweaked to adjust to address this issue only for appointments, not for subscription trips.

Chair Watkins asked by what time after 5pm is this adjustment made? T. Prajapati said this usually happens approximately 6:30pm or 7pm. *Chair Watkins will survey the groups to determine if this is their experience, and circle back to Paratransit.*

S. Veerubhotla asked if cancel late at night, does this shift the route order/times? R. Cohen replied this is not the normal scheduling and dispatch practice. R. Cohen pointed out that these adjustments only apply to making pick-up times earlier, not later.

Again, Chair Watkins said they will gather information about these instances and bring it back to MTA.

5. PARA Topic / Eligibility Process

D. McFarlane introduced staff and provided an overview of AAR Eligibility Process.

J. Ryan inquired about whether assistance can be provided for applicants who have disabilities that prevent them from completing their application. Also, if applicants need to reschedule their assigned date to appear.

S. Onilude responded that if assistance is required to complete the application the applicant may contact the customer service center, and a representative will assist with completing the application. S. Onilude also advised that all applicants may reschedule the assessment appointment. J. Ryan replied that this does happen. D. McFarlane asked that if/when any such instances like this occurs, please contact the customer service center team with applicant's name, ID number so that it may be investigated and addressed.

B. Mitchell inquired about how customers can dispute penalties for No Show/Late Cancellation policy suspensions when there are disputing these allegations. S. Scott explained investigation process and appeal process that goes into making these determinations.

Chair Watkins noted drivers and dispatchers must document their location to mark a trip No Show. S. Harvard explained the process for marking a no show. D. McFarlane added that Paratransit is reviewing detailed information based on data primarily, not only the driver's account. L. Demikhovskaya countered that in her experience drivers do document the location to mark a trip No Show.

J. Ryan shared that customers with Continual Eligibility status should receive an email or phone call prior to expiration of their service. S. Onilude

responded that customers are sent a notification and a phone call reminder. J. Ryan disputed this statement as she did not receive this notification. Chair Watkins responded this matter can be addressed further at a later date.

R. Cohen advised Paratransit will compile written points to share regarding the process for renewing Continual Eligibility. She offered that if this process is not followed, customers should please alert Paratransit.

E-Hail Phase 3

R. Cohen shared there has been positive feedback for Phase 3. Not seeing customers max out their monthly allotment or use the full $60 per trip cap. A small sampling of customers are using the service to full capacity. Cost per trip for MTA has increased (as expected) due to the per trip subsidy cap being increased to $60. Some traditional trips that were formerly with AAR are now moved to e-hail (example: a customer who formerly was assigned to the 25-trip program but now has 40 trips, may now use 30 trips). Included in the testing of the program was to look at the cost differential between new trips and substitute trips. It is clear E-hail Phase 3 is significantly more costly than Phase 2. The data is still being reviewed regarding how this usage is changing. No changes are intended for the next month or so. Overall, the program is going well. The intent is to keep the program running while continuing to evaluate the potential for expanding it.

S. Kraft inquired about whether customers are still being invited to join via the waitlist. R. Cohen confirmed no changes have been made, no customers have been added to the program, but customers continue to be added to the waitlist.

J. Ryan asked how many customers are currently in the program? R. Cohen shared that 1,500 customers are currently registered in the pilot, and about 1,200 are active in any given month. R. Cohen confirmed no additional customers are being added at this time. Looking to use a combination of a sample of customers from waitlist and to ensure there is a representative sample of customers.

Chair Watkins offered that an additional discussion is needed to review the current and projected participants and statistical data of the E-hail Pilot program.

6. **PAC Topic / Broker Service – Chair Watkins noted there will not be enough time to cover this topic during this meeting.**

   B. Mitchell moved to have this item moved to the agenda of the next PAC meeting. The motion was seconded. Motion passed.

7. **New Business**

   No new business.

   B. Mitchell moved to end the meeting. The motion was seconded.

Meeting was adjourned at 6:30 PM.

Paratransit Report

Statistical results for the month of October 2024 are shown below.

Paratransit Operations - Monthly Operations Report Service Indicators											
			Current Month: October 2024						12-Month Average		
Category	Performance Indicator	September'24	2024	2023	2022	Chg Prev Month	Chg 2023	Chg 2022	This Year	Last Year	% Change
Ridership	Total Trips Completed*	801,860	840,832	686,724	575,658	+4.9%	+22.4%	+46.1%	746,192	620,196	+20.3%
	Total Ridership	1,156,048	1,213,220	1,015,887	828,461	+5.0%	+19.4%	+46.4%	1,080,134	904,616	+19.4%
On-Time Performance	Pick-up Primary 20 Minute	83.0%	86.0%	87.0%	90.0%	+3.0%	-1.0%	-4.0%	88.1%	90.0%	-1.9%
	Pick-up Broker 20 Minute	93.0%	94.0%	87.0%	83.0%	+1.0%	+7.0%	+11.0%	92.3%	86.0%	+6.3%
	Pick-up Primary 30 Minute	91.0%	93.0%	94.0%	95.0%	+2.0%	-1.0%	-2.0%	94.4%	95.8%	-1.3%
	Pick-up Broker 30 Minute	97.0%	98.0%	93.0%	93.0%	+1.0%	+5.0%	+5.0%	96.8%	94.0%	+2.8%
	Appointment OTP Trips Primary - 30 Min Early to <1 Late (On-Time)*	52.0%	55.0%	47.0%	51.0%	+3.0%	+8.0%	+4.0%	49.8%	47.8%	+2.1%
	Appointment OTP Trips Primary - Early*	29.0%	29.0%	42.0%	38.0%	0.0%	-13.0%	-9.0%	38.2%	44.8%	-6.6%
	Appointment OTP Trips Broker - 30 Min Early to <1 Late (On-Time)*	53.0%	53.0%	46.0%	42.0%	0.0%	+7.0%	+11.0%	50.6%	40.6%	+10.0%
	Appointment OTP Trips Broker - Early*	32.0%	35.0%	40.0%	47.0%	+3.0%	-5.0%	-12.0%	37.3%	49.0%	-11.8%
Ride Time	Ride Time Variance Performance: Actual Trip Duration vs. Planned Trip Duration - At or Better Than Plan	76.0%	76.0%	79.0%	81.0%	0.0%	-3.0%	-5.0%	80.0%	80.9%	-0.9%
	Average Actual Trip Duration in Minutes	38	38	38	38	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	38	37	+1.6%
	Max Ride Time Performance Primary	97.0%	98.0%	98.0%	97.0%	+1.0%	0.0%	+1.0%	98.3%	98.0%	+0.3%
	Max Ride Time Performance Broker	99.0%	99.0%	99.0%	99.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	99.0%	98.9%	+0.1%
Customer Experience	Frequent Rider Experience Primary*	79.0%	82.0%	82.0%	86.0%	+3.0%	0.0%	0.0%	83.8%	84.3%	-0.5%
	Frequent Rider Experience Broker*	90.0%	91.0%	85.0%	92.0%	+1.0%	+6.0%	6.0%	89.5%	88.8%	+0.7%
Provider No-Shows	Provider No-Shows per 1,000 Schedule Trips Primary	2.10	1.10	0.89	1.30	-47.6%	+23.6%	-15.4%	0.91	0.66	+37.1%
	Provider No-Shows per 1,000 Schedule Trips Broker	1.10	0.90	1.60	4.63	-18.2%	-43.8%	-80.6%	0.93	3.12	-70.3%
Customer Complaints	Passenger Complaints - Transportation Service Quality Per 1000 Completed Trips	4.3	4.6	4.4	2.1	+7.0%	+4.6%	+119.1%	4.0	2.8	+42.2%
	Passenger Complaints - Non-Transportation Service Quality Per 1000 Completed Trips	1.3	1.6	1.1	4.1	+23.1%	+45.5%	-61.0%	1.2	2.6	-55.9%
Call center	Percent of Calls Answered	95.0%	98.0%	97.0%	94.0%	+3.0%	+1.0%	+4.0%	97.1%	95.4%	+1.7%
	Average Call Answer Speed in Seconds	71	22	29	95	-69.0%	-24.1%	-76.8%	33	52	-37.7%
Eligibility	Total Registrants	179,261	n/a	176,501	172,752	n/a	n/a	n/a	177,936	175,622	+1.3%

***** For all Paratransit performance metrics, visit https://metrics.mta.info/**

Note: 1) The percentage comparisons are the percentage point change instead of the percentage change.
2) Trip data and resulting metrics are preliminary and subject to adjustments.
3) Total Registrants data for October 2024 is not available in this report.